

## 27.4: Guide for reviewing a proposal

---

### 27.4.1: Summary

Summarize your overall evaluation of the proposal in 2-3 sentences. Focus on the experiment's methods and goals. For example, "The authors wish to drop balls from different heights to determine the value of  $g$ ". You don't need to go into the specific details, just give a high level summary of the proposal and your opinion on whether this is a strong proposal. If the proposal is unclear, specify this.

### 27.4.2: Review

This is where you give your detailed review of the proposal. Consider the following questions:

- Is the proposed experiment well thought-out and feasible?
- Is the experimental procedure clear and concise? Could you carry out the experiment without asking the authors for additional information? Do the authors specify what instruments to use to measure different quantities and how to determine the associated uncertainties?
- Does the experimental design minimize uncertainties?
- Is it possible to complete the experiment in a reasonable period of time?
- Is it possible to obtain the equipment/materials to conduct the experiment?
- Do the authors describe how to analyze the data (correctly)?
- Does the plan incorporate a mechanism to assess success?
- Is a troubleshooting plan in place, in case of unexpected difficulties?

### 27.4.3: Overall Rating of the Experiment

Give the proposal an overall score, based on the criteria described above. Use one of the following to rate the proposal and include a sentence to justify your choice.

- Excellent
- Good
- Satisfactory
- Needs work
- Incomplete

---

This page titled [27.4: Guide for reviewing a proposal](#) is shared under a [CC BY-SA 4.0](#) license and was authored, remixed, and/or curated by [Ryan D. Martin, Emma Neary, Joshua Rinaldo, and Olivia Woodman](#) via [source content](#) that was edited to the style and standards of the LibreTexts platform.

- [27.4: Guide for reviewing a proposal](#) by Ryan D. Martin, Emma Neary, Joshua Rinaldo, and Olivia Woodman is licensed [CC BY-SA 4.0](#).  
Original source: <https://github.com/OSTP/PhysicsArtofModelling/blob/master/README.md>.